



Trends & Issues—Referees’ report

Title: **Mass shootings and firearm control: Comparing Australia and the United States**

Referee’s Name: S47F [Redacted]

Referee’s Affiliation: S47F [Redacted]

Please check the appropriate score and provide any other comments or suggestions below

Topic	Not at all				Very	Not applicable (or not able to assess).
New/innovative	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>	4 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	5 <input type="checkbox"/>	NA <input type="checkbox"/>
Interesting	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>	4 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	5 <input type="checkbox"/>	NA <input type="checkbox"/>
Policy relevance	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	4 <input type="checkbox"/>	5 <input type="checkbox"/>	NA <input type="checkbox"/>
Appropriate for a T&I	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	4 <input type="checkbox"/>	5 <input type="checkbox"/>	NA <input type="checkbox"/>
Relevance	Low				High	
Relevance to Commonwealth	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>	4 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	5 <input type="checkbox"/>	NA <input type="checkbox"/>
Relevance to states/territories	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>	4 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	5 <input type="checkbox"/>	NA <input type="checkbox"/>
Relevance to criminal justice agencies	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>	4 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	5 <input type="checkbox"/>	NA <input type="checkbox"/>
Substance	Poor				Excellent	
Provides good summary of key issues	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	4 <input type="checkbox"/>	5 <input type="checkbox"/>	NA <input type="checkbox"/>
Appropriate research design	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	4 <input type="checkbox"/>	5 <input type="checkbox"/>	NA <input type="checkbox"/>
Rigorous analysis	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	4 <input type="checkbox"/>	5 <input type="checkbox"/>	NA <input type="checkbox"/>
Conclusions supported by evidence	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	4 <input type="checkbox"/>	5 <input type="checkbox"/>	NA <input type="checkbox"/>
Style	Poor				Excellent	
Written in plain English	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>	4 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	5 <input type="checkbox"/>	NA <input type="checkbox"/>
Logically structured	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>	4 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	5 <input type="checkbox"/>	NA <input type="checkbox"/>
Appropriate and up-to-date references	1 <input type="checkbox"/>	2 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	3 <input type="checkbox"/>	4 <input type="checkbox"/>	5 <input type="checkbox"/>	NA <input type="checkbox"/>

Recommendations (please check box):

1. Accept for publication—no revisions
2. Revisions (please provide details to the authors for revisions)
3. Reject



OTHER COMMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS FOR IMPROVING THE PAPER, please use pages below for additional comments (these will be sent to the author(s) anonymously)

Additional comments:

The draft T&I is interesting to read and well written. However, as outlined below, the draft omits making reference to a number of key Australian articles of relevance. The author(s) should consider making reference to these articles, including the findings and comparative results.

Further comments:

Page 2 – ‘Despite ongoing debate around the efficacies of firearm control (see below for a summary of these), much of the academic literature has to date overlooked the phenomenon of mass shootings. – See the following articles which the author should consider referencing:

CARCACH, C., MOUZOS, J. and GRABOSKY, P. (2002), ‘The Mass Murder as Quasi-Experiment: The Impact of the 1996 Port Arthur Massacre’, *Homicide Studies*, 6: 107–27.

MOUZOS, J. (1999), ‘Firearm-Related Violence: The Impact of the Nationwide Agreement on Firearms’, *Trends and Issues in Crime and Criminal Justice*, 116. Canberra: Australian Institute of Criminology.

REUTER, P. and MOUZOS, J. (2003), ‘Australia: A Massive Buyback of Low-Risk Guns’, in J. Ludwig and P. J. Cook, eds, *Evaluating Gun Policy: Effects on Crime and Violence*. Washington, DC: Brookings Institution Press.

Pages 3-4: ‘The academic literature, particularly that from the US, is quite prolific, supplemented by assessments from Australia and Canada. These studies, however, have produced mixed, if not contradictory results (eg Altheimer & Boswell 2012).’ – See comment above. The review of previous literature omits three Australian studies.

Page 4: ‘The definition adopted here has the advantage of being conservative and includes cases that are not likely to be contested. At the same time, it could be said to significantly understate the problem.’ This may be more an issue in relation to the United States given the incidence of overall homicide in comparison to Australia.

Page 6-7: ‘The US data do not permit establishing the nature of the relationship between the offender and the victims but a review of media reports attached to these incidents revealed there was familiarity between the offender and some of his/her victims in at least some of these cases.’ – This is an important limitation of the current study. If data were available on this variable, it would demonstrate a discernible difference between the types of mass homicides committed in the US in comparison to Australia.

Page 8: ‘These facts raise questions about whether some of these mass shootings could have been averted if noticeable warning signs were (or could have been) acted upon by relatives, neighbours, teachers, co-workers, health professional and/or law enforcement.’ – Any suggestions as to how this may be achieved from a prevention/ intervention perspective?